

MANUSCRIPTOLOGY IN YOGA – AN OVEVIEW

SHARMA, B. R. *

ABSTRACT

The material on yoga is so scanty and scattered in the published literature and the major part of it is still lying hidden in the cupboards of the Manuscript Libraries in the form of Manuscripts (Mss). Therefore, the author felt the need to motivate/educate young scholars to opt this Manuscriptology branch of research in the field of yoga so that horizon of authentic yogic knowledge can be expanded. Author discusses the methods of editing critically the Yoga Mss to reach the authentic version of a manuscript without distorting its originality. Author believes that when critical edition of a text becomes credible it facilitates the process of text based research in further application.

Key Words : Manuscriptology, preservation, reconstruction, method of editing.

Introduction and Statement of the Problem:

Manuscriptology is one of the branches of Literary Research applied for systematic study of ancient/classical material available in **handwritten** forms, called **manuscripts**, to understand the multi-dimensional aspects of a particular cultural heritage. Manuscriptology mainly deals with two aspects - **preservation** of Manuscripts and their **reconstruction** (in the form of critical editions) to reach to the authentic version of a manuscript without distorting its originality.

Manuscriptology was initiated in India around 1868-69. In 1878, the then, Govt. of India took initiatives to preserve old manuscripts. Since then the efforts are being made to preserve and unfold the literary heritage of India hidden in handwritten forms and that too written in a variety of scripts. Today, many scripts have become obsolete and script experts are becoming rare, which hinders the process of preparing critical editions. Govt. of India is helping financially, through its Culture Dept. to those Institutions who are engaged in protecting and exploring this wealth of India. The Project of Digitalization of old manuscripts is initiated and to train the scholars workshops are also being organized across the country.

The major part of ancient and classical Indian literary heritage is written in Sanskrit, partly in Pali and Prakrit also. The Sanskrit literature, which continues since hoary past, encompasses many branches of knowledge – science and arts. However, the major part of this wealth is still awaiting the attention of literary researchers.

* Asst. Director of Research & Head, Philosophico-Literary Research Department, Kaivalyadhama S.M.Y.M. Samiti, Swami Kuvalayananda Marg, Lonavla - 410 403.

Yoga is one of the most important branches of this heritage which, in recent times, has attracted worldwide attention of people wherein they want to know more and more about the theoretical as well as the practical aspects of yoga. However, the material on yoga is so scattered in the literature and also still lying in the cupboards of the Manuscript Libraries in the form of MSS. that it requires an effort to collect all material, analyze it and to present the same in a systematic order so that horizon of yogic wisdom can be expanded but very little attention has been paid in this field till date. Pondering over this problem in Literary Research in general and yogic research in particular an effort has been made here to educate and motivate young scholars to opt this Manuscriptology branch of research in the field of yoga.

For the sake of understanding the topic has been divided into two parts –

A. Nature and Preservation of MSS:

- i. Nature of Handwritten material
- ii. Procedure of preservation
- iii. Recorded No. of MSS
- iv. Procedure of descriptive catalogue

B. Reconstruction of Texts (in the form of critical editions):

- i. Apparatus used in Critical Studies
- ii. The Editor
- iii. Method of Editing
- iv. Recording the observation
 - a. Source
 - b. Nature
 - c. Selection
 - d. Method
 - e. Text
 - f. The Author
 - g. Conclusion
 - h. Appendix

A. i. Nature of Handwritten Material:

As we all know that the literary heritage of India dates back to nearly 4000 years. From that period to 10th century before the advent of printing technology sages, yogis, poets and philosophers etc. wrote on –

1. śilā phalaka i.e. Stone plates
2. mṛtikā phalaka i.e. Brick plates
3. kāṣṭha phalaka i.e. Wooden planks
4. kārpasapaṭikā i.e. cotton cloths
5. bhurjapatra i.e. birch-bark
6. tāḍa patra i.e. palmleaf and later,
7. hand made papers.

In India these handwritten documents are called **mātrkā/ paṇḍulipi** or **pothi** etc..

A. ii. Procedure of Preservation:

General practice for preserving the old Mss is that they are to be kept in almirahs wherein a room that having good exposure of light and air, microfilming methods may be adopted. Now-a-days digitalization is also being adopted. Old saying reads as follows:

‘तैलाद् रक्षेज्जलाद् रक्षेद् रक्षेच्छिथिल बन्धनात् ।
मूर्खहस्ते न दातव्यमेवं वदति पुस्तकम् ॥
सम्भूष्यं सदपत्यवत् पर करात् रक्ष्यं च सुक्षेत्रवत् ।
संशोध्यं व्रणितांगवत् प्रतिदिनं वीक्ष्यं च सन्मित्रवत्’ ॥

Thus speaks the book -

It should be protected from oil and water, let it's binding be not loosened. It should not be landed into fools' hands. Like a good child let it be properly decorated, be it protected from others' hands like a good land. Be it properly cleansed like a wound of (one's) limbs. It is thus be looked upon as a good friend.

. iii. Recorded Number of Mss:

As per the information recorded by Sir William Jones, Lady Jones, and P. D. Gode in 19th & 20th century around 5 lakhs Mss.(written in Sanskrit, Pali and Prakrit) are collected and preserved in 215 Institutes in India, 1 lakh in German, France, Great Britain, Japan, Sri Lanka and Nepal. Many more Mss can be traced out from private sources such as Royal places, traditional families, mathas etc. in India and also other countries.

A. iv. Procedure of Description in Catalogue:

It follows the necessary methods which presents the salient points and other information of Mss in tabular form. They can be outlined as: **Serial no., Title, Source of library, Author, Commentator/**

commentary, material, script, size in cm., folios, lines, letters, extent, condition and age, with other additional particulars (if any) (For description pl. refer any Descriptive Catalogue)

According to Bharati (1988: 34-35), “in 1774-79 one Robert Chambers made a considerable collection and preserved it in Berlin. It is also learnt that in the middle of 1796-1806 one Mackenzie collected ancient Indian Mss, inscriptions, maps and other ancient materials and the East India Company bought this collection for ten thousand pounds. Wilson prepared a limited list for this collection in 1928. In 1868 Pandit Radhakrishna of Lahore Durbar in his letter written to the then Viceroy of India lauded the Government policy in collection and preservation of Sanskrit, Arabic and Persian works and also stressed the necessity for an exhaustive list of Sanskrit manuscripts that might be available in India and European countries.

The credit for the initiative and interest among Europeans towards the study of Sanskrit language for the first time goes to Father Heinrich Roth, a German priest. It is learnt that Roth studied Sanskrit somewhere between 1650 and 1660. In 1665, after his return to Rome, Roth inscribed the Sanskrit alphabets in Devanagari script on five sheets made of metal and gave description of them in the Latin language. It may be said that this is the first and foremost writing which appeared in the form of a book. This was published in 1667 at Amsterdam. Even then the first catalogue of Sanskrit manuscripts saw the light of the day in 1807. Since till 1940 about 164 catalogues have been published in different parts of world. Out of them around one hundred catalogues are published in India.” Many more works like A History of Sanskrit Literature by A. B. Keith and A History of Dharmashastra by P.V Kane, Catalogues Catalogum of Aufrecht etc. etc. are useful aids for Literary Research.

However, they do not provide requisite information about Yoga Mss. Moreover, published Catalogues in Oriental Libraries include non yogic Mss under Yoga head and some Yogic Mss are classified under Tantras, Dharmashastra etc. This creates problems in collecting yoga Mss. Keeping all this in mind **Philosophico-Literary Research Dept. of Kaivalyadhama, Lonavla**, published **Descriptive Catalogue of Yoga Manuscripts** in 1989 which was containing the information of 2300 Yoga Mss. The same has been recently updated (2005) by adding the information of more than 574 Mss. The updated edition of this catalogue contains information of 2874 manuscripts under 837 Titles. This is a first work of its own kind in the field of yoga which will help the yoga researchers to locate the information of a particular manuscript of yoga.

B. Reconstruction of Texts (in the form of critical editions):

This work purports to make systematic presentation of an author's work with necessary modification, revision without involving any change. In other words critical edition is a careful

analysis of manuscript in an objective outlook to reach the authentic version of the text without distorting its originality. Ramachandran (1984:63) suggests “It is a criticism or discursion, not about the ideas in the text but about the text itself, i.e., the verbal expression, or wording, of the composition”.

B. i. Apparatus used in Critical Studies:

Critical apparatus includes the material used in this process. The materials are outlined as –

1) Primary apparatus

2) Secondary apparatus

1. Primary apparatus encompasses –

ii) Author's own handwritten copy (original)

ii) Rewritten or transmitted copies

Original copy of a manuscript is considered to be genuine for critical edition but it is very difficult to get the original copy and therefore, one has to depend upon the transmitted copies wherein deterioration, alteration and sometime deliberate changes are found which hinder the researchers in determining the original text. It, therefore, becomes necessary to collect as many more manuscript of the same title to do the comparative study. The researchers reach to the original version through comparison of such copies..

2. Secondary apparatus –

It includes the ancient commentaries, epitomes, adoptions, anthologies and descriptive catalogues on the basis of which historical aspect of the manuscript is determined.

B. ii. The Editor:

Editor should be well versed in the field to which the manuscript of study belongs. Knowing a particular language may not help and therefore, in-depth knowledge of the subject is essential which plays a very important role to determine the correct version of the text.

B. iii. Method of Editing:

i) Manuscripts of the same title and of the same author are to be collected as many as possible.

ii) Collected MSS are to be classified as A, B, C, D or Ka, Kha, Ga

iii) Content of all should be compared word by word.

iv) Variant readings should be collected separately

- v) The insignificant mistakes of the writer are to be corrected.
- vi) Mistakes pertaining to grammar or to metre of the verses are to be noted separately.
- vii) Author's own assumptions of dealing with the content are to be taken as internal evidence for determining the final version of the text etc.

Bharati (1988:40) provides list of such mistakes classified by different scholars as under:

- i) Confusion arises out of letters of shape and similarity
- ii) Copying on the basis of the general resemblance of words.
- iii) Considering a position of a sentence as the concluding line and rest of the sentence to the next portion.
- iv) Changing the position of letters, words and sentences
- v) Changing wrongly Sanskrit words to prakrit or prakrit to Sanskrit
- vi) Errors arising out of change in pronunciation
- vii) Confusion of numerals
- viii) Confusion of proper names
- ix) Using words of current usage or words of equal meaning in place of rare words.
- x) Replacing new letters instead of old letters.
- xi) Dropping letters and words etc.

It Many times interpolation (prakshpta portion) in the MSS creates problem for the editor, these are deliberately added with a view to represent the text in a better way. Bharati (1988:48) records the reasons for such interpolation as under –

- i) In order to cover up the obscure portions in a work, such portions are added a fresh effecting or change.
- ii) Inclusions of wider portion by adding a new line or verse. Sometimes it becomes difficult to identify such verses.
- iii) Adding stories and sub stories.
- iv) Expanding the subject suitable to circumstances
- v) Inclusion of left out lines out of guess.
- vi) If any portion of the work is not appealing to the scribes, such portion, whether accurate or not, is amended as their imagination leads etc.

becomes the responsibility of the editor to detect such portions and carefully examine those as to whether they form the part of original writing.

B. iv. Recording the observations:

Introduction to a critical edition records the result of collation. All procedures, strategies adopted for studying the manuscript are noted in the introduction. Introduction provides the entire picture of study of manuscript. While writing introduction the editor should emphasis the following points –

a) Source :

- i. Sources of manuscript be mentioned
- ii. Description of the sources

b) Nature :

- i) Background and history of MSS should be indicated
- ii) Nature of each copy be specified
- iii) List of critical apparatus be given
- iv) Specimen may be supplied
- v) A formal description regarding size, line, number of leaves and lines etc. be given.

c) Selection -

- i) The procedure of classification of MSS be mentioned.
- ii) The reason for selecting a particular MSS
- iii) A list of rejected MSS and reason for rejecting be mentioned.

d) Method –

- i) Methods adopted for collection should be made clear
- ii) Use of marks should be shown
- iii) Principles applied for determining the nature of text should also be discussed.

e) Text -

- i) The formal division of the text is to be indicated.
- ii) It is to be established whether the text is complete, incomplete or discontinued, if discontinued what could be the reason for it.
- iii) The amount of interpolation (if any)
- iv) Errors and omissions be discussed
- v) The appropriateness of the title be discussed tallying the same with colophon.
- vi) The importance of benedictory and dedicatory verses be underlined.
- vii) The content of the manuscript be briefly noted.
- viii) Its specialty should be exhibited.
- ix) Some controversial and conflicting points are to be analyzed etc.

f) The Author –

- i. The determination of authorship is a general problem for ancient MSS. The editor should therefore, produce possible evidences in support of his argument in case of controversy.
- ii. Description of place and date of author be given (if any)
- iii. Details about the life and other work of the same author be mentioned
- iv. Author's treatment of the subject, method and style of presentation be discussed
- v. Any other scholastic and historical affiliations of the author should be indicated.

g) Conclusion –

- i) Usefulness of the work may be stated
- ii) Special remarks and other intrinsic apprehension to be placed in the conclusion.

h) Appendix –

At the end additional information may be accommodated as under –

- i. Name index
- ii. Subject index
- iii. List of important versions
- iv. A glossary of technical terms
- v. Alphabetical list of verses
- vi. Any other references that deem fit.

Concluding Remark:

The textual criticism is an important aspect of Literary Research. It is important because unless and until the exact matter of a text is honestly represented no investigation to its content be done satisfactory. When critical edition of a text becomes credible it facilitates the process of text based research in further applications.

REFERENCES

- Bharati, H. L. N.: (1988), An Introduction to Indian Textual criticism, Book published CIIL, Mysore, India.
- Brochure (1924-1999), Philosolphico-Literary Research Department, Kaivalyadhama Plutonium Jubilee Celebration, Kaivalyadhama, Lonavla 410 403.

Chaudhary C. M.: (1991), Research Methodology, RBSA Publisher, S.M.S: Highway, Jaipur - 302 003 (India).

Dash Keshab Chandra: (1992), Elements of Research Methodology in Sanskrit, Chaukhamba Sanskrit Samsthan, Varanasi - 221 001 (India).

Dictionary: (1952), The Advanced Learners Dictionary of Current English, Oxford.

Dr. Sukhathankar, V.S.: (1933), Mahabharata, B.O.R.I, Vol. I., Part I, pp I-CXII, Pune.

John W. Best: (!977-78), Research in education, Prentice Hall, New Delhi

Lele, W.K. : (1981), The doctrine of the Tantra Yuktis, Chaukhamba Surbharati Prakashan, Varanasi (India)

Nalwa Vanit : (1992), The ABC of Research, Wiley Eastern Ltd., 4835/24, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, New Delhi - 110 002 (India)

Souvenir (2002), 4th International Conference Yoga Research and Value Education - 28-31 December, 2002, Kaivalyadhama, Lonavla - 410 403 (India).

Author's Note:

The author is grateful to Swāmi Maheśānandaji, Chairman and Director of Research and Shri O.P. Tiwariji, Secretary, Kaivalyadhama S.M.Y.M.Samiti Lonavla for their inspiration. My sincere thanks are due to all the researchers of Kaivalyadhama, especially to my colleagues Shri G. S. Sahay and Shri R. K. Bodhe, for going through the draft copy of this article and for their suggestions. My thanks are also due to Mr. P. H. Raut for the tedious typographical work.

* * * * *

TOLERANCE OF CULTURE AND CULTURE OF TOLERANCE

BODHE, R. K. *

ABSTRACT

In our modern times of value crisis in every walk of life, including education, what is needed is not a superficial and sporadic change here and there, but the need is to bring a drastic change in the very outlook of man and in his life values. In the absence of this the world will continue to be overpowered by narrow casteism, communalism, linguistic, regional, racial and national strife and struggle and disharmony and so on. In this paper, based on yogic wisdom, an attempt has been made to analyse the concept of 'tolerance' and the need of practicing it and it is contended that:

- a) *Tolerance is a virtue*
- b) *Pluralistic, democratic, secular and realistic society necessitates the practice (culture) of tolerance.*
- c) *Intolerance and its associated conditions, tendencies and other evil practices, on individual and national level, such as mere material pursuit, egoism, centralization, totalitarianism, despotism, terrorism, anarchism etc., are according to yogic analysis, the results of the worship of false gods or in other words due to the lack of or wrong understanding of one's own self.*
- a) *Yogic way of life provides required rationale for the culture of Tolerance and engenders a positive/conducive change in the very outlook and the value system of a man.*

Key Words: *Tolerance, culture, egoism, religious tolerance, values.*

Introduction

Among various precepts, practices, values etc. that mankind has evolved and that are helpful to it in realizing peace, harmony, freedom and many other cherished values and ideologies, is the characteristic called the spirit of tolerance. The peaceful co-existence has this spirit as its base. The spirit of tolerance is a necessary requisite of a worldview, which accommodates diversity and plurality, individuality and particularity. Lest the lack of this spirit or unhealthy understanding thereof, might lead us to timidity, egoism and/or blindness towards the truth of diversity and variety we should develop a proper understanding of the term 'tolerance' and culture it.

Discussion

According to one understanding of the term tolerance (1921, 1967) it signifies a policy of patient

* Research Officer, Philosophico-Literary Research Dept., Kaivalyadhama, S.M.Y.M. Samiti, Lonavla 410 403.